
South Carolina Department of Commerce

Columbia, South Carolina

Independent Accountant's Report on Applying Agreed-Upon
Procedures for the year ended June 30, 2012

State of South Carolina



Office of the State Auditor

1401 MAIN STREET, SUITE 1200
COLUMBIA, S.C. 29201

RICHARD H. GILBERT, JR., CPA
DEPUTY STATE AUDITOR

(803) 253-4160
FAX (803) 343-0723

March 19, 2013

The Honorable Nikki R. Haley, Governor
and
Mr. Robert M. Hitt III, Secretary of Commerce
South Carolina Department of Commerce
Columbia, South Carolina

This report resulting from the application of certain agreed-upon procedures to certain internal controls and accounting records of the South Carolina Department of Commerce for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2012, was issued by Brown CPA, LLC, Certified Public Accountants, under contract with the South Carolina Office of the State Auditor.

If you have any questions regarding this report, please let us know.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Richard H. Gilbert Jr.", written in a cursive style.

Richard H. Gilbert, Jr., CPA
Deputy State Auditor

RHGjr/trb

Contents

	<u>Page</u>
I. Independent Accountant’s Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures	1-4
II. Accountant’s Comments	
Section A – Other Weakness	5
Section B – Status of Prior Findings	5
Management’s Response	Attachment A

Independent Accountant's Report on Applying Agreed-Upon Procedures

Mr. Richard H. Gilbert, Jr., CPA
Deputy State Auditor
State of South Carolina
Columbia, South Carolina

We have performed the procedures described below, which were agreed to by the South Carolina Office of State Auditor and management of South Carolina Department of Commerce (the "Department"), solely to assist you in evaluating the performance of the Department for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2012, in the areas addressed. The Department's management is responsible for its financial records, internal controls and compliance with State laws and regulations. This agreed-upon procedures engagement was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. The sufficiency of these procedures is solely the responsibility of the specified parties in this report. Consequently, we make no representation regarding the sufficiency of the procedures described below either for the purpose for which this report has been requested or for any other purpose.

The procedures and the associated findings are as follows:

1. **Cash Receipts and Revenues**

- We inspected selected recorded receipts to determine if these receipts were properly described and classified in the accounting records in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations.
- We inspected selected recorded receipts to determine if these receipts were recorded in the proper fiscal year.
- We made inquiries and performed substantive procedures to determine if revenue collection and retention or remittance were supported by law.
- We compared current year recorded revenues at the subfund and account level from sources other than State General Fund appropriations to those of the prior year. We investigated changes in the earmarked, restricted and federal funds to ensure that revenue was classified properly in the Department's accounting records. The scope was based on agreed upon materiality levels \$220,000 – earmarked fund, \$160,000 – restricted fund, and \$170,000 – federal fund and ± 10 percent.

The individual transactions selected were chosen randomly. We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

2. **Non-Payroll Disbursements and Expenditures**

- We inspected selected recorded non-payroll disbursements to determine if these disbursements were properly described and classified in the accounting records in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations, were bona fide disbursements of the Department, and were paid in conformity with State laws and regulations; if the acquired goods and/or services were procured in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- We inspected selected recorded non-payroll disbursements to determine if these disbursements were recorded in the proper fiscal year.
- We compared current year expenditures at the subfund and account level to those of the prior year. We investigated changes in the general, earmarked, restricted and federal funds to ensure that expenditures were classified properly in the Department's accounting records. The scope was based on agreed upon materiality levels \$67,000 – general fund, \$260,000 – earmarked fund, \$95,000 – restricted fund, and \$180,000 – federal fund and ± 10 percent. The individual transactions selected were chosen randomly. We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

3. **Payroll Disbursements and Expenditures**

- We inspected selected recorded payroll disbursements to determine if the selected payroll transactions were properly described, classified, and distributed in the accounting records; persons on the payroll were bona fide employees; payroll transactions were properly authorized and were in accordance with existing legal requirements and processed in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations.
- We inspected payroll transactions for selected new employees and those who terminated employment to determine if the employees were added and/or removed from the payroll in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures, that the employee's first and/or last pay check was properly calculated and that the employee's leave payout was properly calculated in accordance with applicable State law.
- We compared current year payroll expenditures at the subfund and account level to those of the prior year. We investigated changes in the general, earmarked, restricted and federal funds to ensure that expenditures were classified properly in the Department's accounting records. The scope was based on agreed upon materiality levels \$67,000 – general fund, \$260,000 – earmarked fund, \$95,000 – restricted fund, and \$180,000 – federal fund and ± 10 percent.
- We compared the percentage change in recorded personal service expenditures to the percentage change in employer contributions; and computed the percentage distribution of recorded fringe benefit expenditures by fund source and compared the computed distribution to the actual distribution of recorded payroll expenditures by fund source. We investigated changes of ± 15 percent to ensure that payroll expenditures were classified properly in the Department's accounting records.

The individual transactions selected were chosen randomly. We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

4. **Journal Entries, Operating Transfers and Appropriation Transfers**

- We inspected selected recorded journal entries, operating transfers, and appropriation transfers to determine if these transactions were properly described and classified in the accounting records; they agreed with the supporting documentation, the purpose of the

transactions was documented and explained, the transactions were properly approved, and were mathematically correct; and the transactions were processed in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations.

The individual transactions selected were chosen randomly. We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

5. **General Ledger and Subsidiary Ledgers**

- We inspected selected entries and monthly totals in the subsidiary records of the Department to determine if the amounts were mathematically accurate; the numerical sequences of selected document series were complete; the selected monthly totals were accurately posted to the general ledger; and selected entries were processed in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations.

The transactions selected were chosen randomly. We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

6. **Composite Reservoir Accounts**

Reconciliations

- We obtained all monthly reconciliations prepared by the Department for the year ended June 30, 2012, and inspected selected reconciliations of balances in the Department's accounting records to those reflected on the State Treasurer's Office monthly reports to determine if accounts reconciled. For the selected reconciliations, we determined if they were timely performed and properly documented in accordance with State regulations, recalculated the amounts, agreed the applicable amounts to the Department's general ledger, agreed the applicable amounts to the State Treasurer's Office monthly reports, determined if reconciling differences were adequately explained and properly resolved, and determined if necessary adjusting entries were made in the Department's accounting records.

Cash Receipts and Revenues

- We inspected selected recorded receipts to determine if these receipts were properly described and classified in the accounting records in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations.
- We inspected selected recorded receipts to determine if these receipts were recorded in the proper fiscal year.
- We made inquiries and performed substantive procedures to determine if revenue collection and retention or remittance were supported by law. We obtained all monthly reconciliations prepared by the Department.

Non-Payroll Disbursements and Expenditures

- We inspected selected recorded non-payroll disbursements to determine if these disbursements were properly described and classified in the accounting records in accordance with the Department's policies and procedures and State regulations, were bona fide disbursements of the Department, and were paid in conformity with State laws and regulations; if the acquired goods and/or services were procured in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.
- We inspected selected recorded non-payroll disbursements to determine if these disbursements were recorded in the proper fiscal year.

The reconciliations selected were chosen randomly. We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

7. Appropriation Act

- We inspected documents, observed processes, and/or made inquiries of Department personnel to determine the Department's compliance with Appropriation Act general and Department specific provisos.

We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

8. Reporting Packages

- We obtained copies of all closing packages as of and for the year ended June 30, 2012 prepared by the Department and submitted to the State Comptroller General. We inspected them to determine if they were prepared in accordance with the Comptroller General's Reporting Policies and Procedures Manual requirements; and if the amounts reported in the closing packages agreed with the supporting workpapers and accounting records.

Our finding as a result of these procedures is presented in the Accountant's Comments section of this report.

9. Schedule of Federal Financial Assistance

- We obtained a copy of the schedule of federal financial assistance for the year ended June 30, 2012, prepared by the Department and submitted to the State Auditor. We inspected it to determine if it was prepared in accordance with the State Auditor's letter of instructions; if the amounts agreed with the supporting workpapers and accounting records.

We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

10. Status of Prior Findings

- We inquired about the status of the finding(s) reported in the Accountant's Comments section of the Independent Accountant's Agreed-Upon Procedures report on the Department resulting from the engagement for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2011, to determine if the Department has taken corrective action.

We found no exceptions as a result of the procedures.

We were not engaged to and did not conduct an audit, the objective of which would be the expression of an opinion on the specified elements, accounts, or items. Accordingly, we do not express such an opinion. Had we performed additional procedures, other matters might have come to our attention that would have been reported to you.

This report is intended solely for the information and use of the Governor, the South Carolina Office of the State Auditor, and the Secretary and management of the Department of Commerce and is not intended to be and should not be used by anyone other than these specified parties.

BROWN CPA, L.L.C.

Irmo, South Carolina
March 15, 2013

Accountant's Comments

SECTION A - OTHER WEAKNESS

Management of each State agency is responsible for establishing and maintaining internal controls to ensure compliance with State Laws, Rules or Regulations. The condition described in this section has/have been identified while performing the agreed-upon procedures but it is not considered a violation of State Laws, Rules or Regulations.

Reporting Package Testwork

Comment – During the testing of the Department's Cash and Investments reporting package submitted to the South Carolina Office of the Comptroller General it was determined that the Department underreported the cash account book balance in a composite reservoir account by \$132,776. The Department reported a book balance of \$12,856; the Department should have reported \$145,632.

Recommendation – We recommend that the Department review the amounts reported in the various reporting packages more thoroughly prior to submission to the South Carolina Office of the Comptroller General.

SECTION B – STATUS OF PRIOR FINDINGS

Comment - June 30, 2011 Report	Status
<p>#1 Closing Package Testwork – Attorney General Authorization The Department did not obtain approval from the Attorney General's Office before incurring legal expenses from a private attorney. The Department subsequently obtained approval from the Attorney General's Office, but not prior to receiving the legal services.</p>	Corrective action taken.
<p>#2 Revenue Testwork As a result of our comparison of current year recorded revenues to prior year recorded revenues we became aware that there was a misclassification at the account level. The Department overstated sale of services account #4480020000 by \$787,936, the amount should have been reported as Nonrecurring Operating Transfers account #4890020000.</p>	Corrective action taken.

Attachment A



Nikki R. Haley
Governor

SOUTH CAROLINA
DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

Robert M. Hitt III
Secretary

March 18, 2013

BROWN, CPA. LLC
Mr. Matt Brown
Post Office Box 3288
Irmo, South Carolina 29063

Dear Mr. Brown:

This letter is in response to the Schedule of Findings in the Agreed Upon Procedures audit for the period ending June 30, 2012 for the South Carolina Department of Commerce.

The department will take the necessary steps to correct the item mentioned in the report.

It is the absolute commitment of the South Carolina Department of Commerce to continue to be good stewards of the taxpayer's dollars while ensuring that our financial reporting is accurate and timely. The Department appreciates your willingness to offer advice and assistance throughout the year.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Chris Huffman".

Chris Huffman
Chief Financial Officer
South Carolina Department of Commerce